How America Voted: By Voice

DONALD A. DEBATS

sociallogic.iath.virginia.edu
Public Voting

How America Voted: By Voice

by

Donald A. DeBats, PhD
Residential Fellow, Virginia Foundation for the Humanities, University of Virginia
Head, American Studies, Flinders University, Australia

The transparency of Election Day—being able to see or hear the choices of each voter—helped make past politics the mass spectacle that it was. And the most transparent way of voting was *viva voce*: calling out in public the name of the candidate you wanted for each office.

If the secret ballot was an Australian import that came to the US across the Pacific, *viva voce* arrived from the other direction—across the Atlantic from Britain and Europe (in Scandinavia, the Netherlands, and the German provinces) where oral voting had long been electoral law. In North America, it was the law across Canada and in six of the original American colonies, ranging from New York to Georgia. Westward settlement took *viva voce* to Kentucky, Illinois, Missouri, Arkansas, Texas and Oregon.

Cover and opposite

The County Election, George Caleb Bingham, 1852. This painting is the centerpiece of Bingham’s Election Series, which documents the process of a *viva voce* election from stump speeches to the reading of the results. Bingham completed the six paintings in the series between 1849 and 1855. This particular scene depicts Bingham’s deeply personal analysis of the 1846 and 1848 state legislative elections in Saline County, Missouri which were conducted, under state law, by *viva voce* vote. The County Election is the only depiction of a US election conducted *viva voce*. Bingham was a Whig candidate for the Missouri state legislature in both contests and won both, only to be denied his seat in the 1846 legislature by the manipulation of the wealthy powerbrokers of the “Central Clique” of Missouri’s Democratic Party. He ran again in 1848 and this time soundly defeated his nemesis, Erasmus D Sappington, his opponent in 1846 whose father, a central figure in the clique, was deeply involved in overturning Bingham’s 1846 victory. That was a close election, decided by three votes, and the clique ousted Bingham and installed Sappington by challenging the residential status and age of a handful of men who had voted for Bingham. Many of the characters in the painting are based on real individuals from Saline County who were key figures in the 1846 and 1848 contests. This painting depicts all of the activity and excitement surrounding a *viva voce* Election Day and the wide swath of socio-economic groups that were participating in the vote. The African American dispensing hard cider from a jug was probably a slave as Missouri was a slave state and the Sappington family was among the wealthiest in the county and the largest slaveholders.

George Caleb Bingham, American, 1811-1879; *The County Election*, 1852; oil on canvas; 38 x 52 in. (96.5 x 132.1 cm); Saint Louis Art Museum, Gift of Bank of America 44.2001.
Viva voce voting was the defining feature of the political worlds of Washington, Jefferson, Madison, Monroe and Lincoln, all of whom came to political leadership in states that voted by voice. Its high point coincided with the great expansion of the suffrage: the era still sometimes referred to as “the golden age” of American political participation. Oral voting gradually waned, but even in the presidential election of 1860 nearly ten percent of the vote was cast by voice. In the 1830s five of the 26 states voted viva voce (Virginia, Kentucky, Missouri, Arkansas, and Illinois); in the 1850s five of the 33 states did so with Oregon replacing Illinois and Texas giving up its brief experiment with oral voting; in the 1870s only Kentucky and Oregon continued to vote viva voce. In 1891 Kentucky became the last state in the Union to practice oral voting and the only American state to move directly from voting by voice to an Australian invention: the state-produced secret ballot.

The objection to viva voce, of course, was that it invited intimidation and coercion, of employees by employers, of the weak by the powerful, and of individuals by groups. Yet it remains the case, perhaps ironically, that turnout was at its highest when public voting, by voice or by ticket, prevailed. Turnout went down with the introduction of secret voting.

Indeed the notion that open voting inevitably produced intimidated voters may be countered by an extreme case of power differentials: the electoral behavior of former slaves in Kentucky. Despite an economy based on slavery, Kentucky, Lincoln’s home state, remained loyal to the Union during the Civil War. As a “loyal state” Kentucky was not subject to many of the Congresional

Opposite

Two Citizens, George Caleb Bingham, c.1852. As with the other characters in The County Election (1852), the men depicted in this preliminary sketch were based on real citizens of Saline County, Missouri. The man with the stooped shoulders was identified by Dr. Oscar F. Potter, a local resident and a subject for Bingham’s paintings, as O.B. Pearson, a business agent for the Sappington family. In this drawing, Bingham presents Pearson attempting to persuade a clearly dubious local farmer identified by Potter only as Lyle, to vote for Erasmus D. Sappington. In the final painting, Bingham included a second farmer, identified as Thornton, also being addressed by Pearson; with his hands firmly behind his back, Thornton appears equally sceptical.

George Caleb Bingham, Two Citizens, brush, black ink and wash over pencil on wove paper, 31 x 30 ins. Collection, The People of Missouri, The Bingham Trust, gift of Mr. and Mrs. Joseph Pulitzer, Jr., The Post-Dispatch Foundation and KSDK-TV Incorporated. Image courtesy Saint Louis Art Museum, photography by Brian van Czarnik.
requirements of Reconstruction. African-American men in Kentucky gained the right to vote with the passage of the Fifteenth Amendment, but because it had remained a Union state, Kentucky was exempt from Reconstruction Acts that required the Confederate states to abolish *viva voce* voting as a condition of re-admission. Instead, Kentucky persevered with its ante-bellum laws and “by voice” voting persisted another quarter of a century.

Thus in Kentucky, and only in Kentucky, is there an official record—the poll books—which tells us how former slaves used the suffrage in the tumultuous Reconstruction years. What we see are many newly enfranchised black men voting solidly Republican, sometimes calling out their vote just before or after their former masters, almost all of whom had become part of the Southern white Democratic Party. Eventually the black vote in Kentucky would be largely extinguished through laws designed for that purpose, but for many years the poll books show us black men who, especially in strong black communities, persevered in exercising the power of the vote against what must have been fearsome odds.

*Viva voce* voting finally disappeared from the American political landscape by 1896, leaving in many places the only official records—the poll books—to reveal the electoral behavior of individuals in America’s long history of public voting. Poll books are the documents compiled by election clerks on the day of the election; they preserve the vote of every participant for every office as that voter came before the officials. They are the written record of what spectators heard.

Election clerks created these records, sitting at tables on the raised platforms onto which voters ascended, one by one, to voice their vote. They inscribed...
on the left side of each page of their book the names of the voter as he came before them. They then indicated by number or tick across the page his choice of candidates for each of the many offices being filled at that election. Electoral law in the nine New states required this mode of election for all offices, from president, Congress (until 1867), and state legislature, to the most prosaic city or county office. Post-election, the poll books became public documents and the evidentiary base for disputed elections. Those that survive are remarkable political documents: each an historical reenactment of a long-past political contest presenting the voting decisions of every citizen and the order in which those declarations were made.

Poll books are our own treasure trove of political information, data that even the most skilled of today’s political operatives cannot obtain.

Opposite

Poll Book, Alexandria, Virginia, May 26, 1859. This poll book is from the Third District (Ward 3) of Alexandria city and preserves the choices of all voters at that polling place (held at the County Courthouse) for Virginia’s governor, lieutenant governor and attorney general. In complicated elections such as this one with large numbers of voters for several different offices being filled, election clerks at each of the polling stations compiled separate poll books for different sets of elections, making quite different decisions as to which offices to combine. In the Third Ward a second poll book was created listing the voters for the Oppositions and Democratic candidates for Virginia House of Delegates (see profile of Lewis McKenzie on this website) and the US Congress from Virginia’s 7th Congressional District. The sequence of names is identical in both poll books, indicating that the voters called out all five of their choices at one time. This protocol was followed in all nine vote states, even when 20 or more offices were being filled, necessitating multiple poll books. There were four polling stations in Alexandria city; one per ward: two were established outside public buildings (the Council Chamber in addition to the County Courthouses) and two outside private houses which were probably linked to taverns.

Alexandria City Poll Books, Virginia State Library.
Voting Viva Voce
Unlocking the Social Logic of Past Politics
sociallogic.iath.virginia.edu

Two mid-nineteenth century cities—Alexandria, Virginia and Newport, Kentucky—shared a common voting arrangement: both states required all votes in all elections to be cast in public by voice (viva voce). The poll books provided an official written record of every voter’s spoken declaration. Professor Don DeBats presents and analyses this data on the website.

Public Voting. This project reveals the world of American politics at a time when every citizen’s vote was public knowledge, and how social identity influenced votes.

Alexandria, Virginia | 1850s. On the Potomac just opposite Washington DC, Alexandria was a thriving commercial city based on slave labor in the late 1850’s as the secession crisis loomed.

Newport, Kentucky | 1870. On the Ohio just opposite Cincinnati, Newport was, as the Panic of 1873 crashed down, a thriving industrial city based on immigrant labor.

Colophon
Text | Donald A. DeBats
Design | Anne Chesnut

Published by The Institute for Advanced Technology in the Humanities
In conjunction with the generous support of: Virginia Foundation for the Humanities, Flinders University, National Endowment for the Humanities, Australian Research Council, and Institute for Advanced Technology in the Humanities
All rights reserved. © Copyright 2016
Rectors and Visitors of the University of Virginia